Purang –

Minor suggestions – References please add Abtin Rasoulian for statistical atlas and visualization.

2.3.3

Enough US images in your thesis. In cases things didn’t work, why? Show artifacts in the image that caused this. Some comments on (discussion) how sensitive is the method to parameters of the US? Gain, …morphology and intensity

4.5

Kamali – segmentation – there was no extensive test done for sensitivity to parameters.

4.5

Validation – table 1 – page 35 – how many patients were recruited, what was the data? Add discussion. Related to US data in Fig 17, 18? Are they related? Clarify that table 1 is only CT data.

3.3, 3.5

You could have simulated the errors of Chapter 4 inChapter 3? Can you add to future work?

5.2

P49, Chapter 4 – how many parameters do you have? Did you use the same parameters for the subjects? Mention that in your thesis.

Did you find a set of parameters that worked for these set of patients?

Each operation’ subsection, and 4.4, 4.5

Manuela –

Chapter 3 – extra landmarks. The right- left vector or what convention?

Text should be corrected to explain how do you did your cross product and vector directions.

3.4.2

Number equations.

3.4.2

Why 16 patients?

3.5

Standard deviations should have been higher for Chapter 3? The patients were kids and the healthy spine an adult?

3.5

Challenging criteria for Chapter 3 – are you evaluating the complete volume. Monitoring for scoliosis is the application. What would the physician be interested in? Why did you not use cobb angle?

3.5

Chapter 4 – iterative k-means k 1-34? How does this work? Methods not clear. What was the general number of K in your test data.

4.2

When defining right-left classifications, how did you define directions?

4.3.1

How long does the US scan take? Would a child stand still that long?

5.2

Why did not collect repeat scans?

4.5, 5.2

Is this is scoliosis monitoring tool, would better initialization from the previous scan be a better option than start from scratch?

5.3

Gabor

Who is going to be using this? Chiropractic - needs the visualization for lay people mostly to help understand.

5.3

Follow up work – sensitivity to landmarks – how robust is your visualization to those errors?

3.5

Future work – where would you go? No landmarks?

4.5, 4.6, 5.2